

A bounded set in \mathbb{Q} without supremum

The following example shows that the field \mathbb{Q} is not completely ordered, i.e. there are bounded subsets of \mathbb{Q} without supremum (in \mathbb{Q} !).

As an example we choose

$$A := \{x \in \mathbb{Q} \mid x > 0 \wedge x^2 < 2\}.$$

1. Clearly $1 \in A \neq \emptyset$, furthermore A is bounded above, as for $x > 2$ we have $x > 0$ and $x^2 > 4 > 2$, so 2 is an upper bound for A .

2. Assume $c \in \mathbb{Q}$ is the supremum of A . Then $c \geq 1 > 0$. We show:

$$\forall \xi \in \mathbb{Q}: \quad 0 < \xi < c \implies \xi \in A. \quad (1)$$

From $\xi < c = \sup A$ it follows that ξ is not an upper bound for A , therefore there is $\xi' > \xi$ with $\xi' \in A$, so $\xi'^2 < 2$ and therefore $\xi^2 < \xi'^2 < 2$, so $\xi \in A$.

3. Define

$$\xi := \frac{2c+2}{c+2}.$$

Then certainly $\xi > 0$ and $\xi \in \mathbb{Q}$. It is easily checked that

$$\xi = c - \frac{c^2 - 2}{c + 2}, \quad (2)$$

$$\xi^2 = 2 + \frac{2(c^2 - 2)}{(c + 2)^2}. \quad (3)$$

4. As there is no rational number z with $z^2 = 2$, one of the two strict inequalities $c^2 < 2$ or $c^2 > 2$ must hold. In both cases, we will derive a contradiction.

$$\text{I. } \left. \begin{array}{l} c^2 < 2 \xrightarrow{(2)} \xi > c \implies \xi \notin A \implies \xi^2 > 2 \\ \xrightarrow{(3)} \xi^2 < 2 \end{array} \right\} \text{contradiction.}$$

$$\text{II. } \left. \begin{array}{l} c^2 > 2 \xrightarrow{(2)} \xi < c \xrightarrow{(1)} \xi \in A \implies \xi^2 < 2 \\ \xrightarrow{(3)} \xi^2 > 2 \end{array} \right\} \text{contradiction.}$$

Therefore, the set A can have no rational supremum. ■